

PLANNING COMMISSION

Meeting Date: 02/05/18

ADDITIONAL ITEM ADDED AFTER DISTRIBUTION OF PACKET (# 1)

AGENDA ITEM # 3

Applicant/Project Name Fenton-Discovery P# 16-0037

Brief Description: Village South

Letter from Pechanga Cultural Resources
Temecula Band of Luiseno Mission Indians
Attd. 1/25/18

Date 02/05/18

Time 4:30 pm

MEMORANDUM

TO: Planning Commission

FROM: Planning Division

DATE: February 5, 2018

SUBJECT: Planning Commission Meeting – February 5, 2018
Agenda Item # 3 (Fenton – Discovery Village South)

Submittal of Letter after Mitigated Negative Declaration Public Review Period

Pechanga Tribe Comments:

The Temecula Band of Mission Indians (Pechanga Tribe) submitted the attached letter dated January 25, 2018 to request tribal historical detail edits in the Discovery Village South project Cultural Resources Survey and Evaluation Report (technical report) prepared by Dudek & Associates. In the letter, the Pechanga Tribe also acknowledges and concurs with the Discovery Village South project Mitigated Negative Declaration cultural mitigation measures. The requested edits do not affect the mitigation measures or conclusions of the Mitigated Negative Declaration analysis for Cultural Resources and Tribal Cultural Resources. Dudek will make final edits to the technical report upon project completion.

The item listed above is attached and has been added to the packet on the City's website.



PECHANGA CULTURAL RESOURCES

Temecula Band of Luiseño Mission Indians

Post Office, Box 2183 • Temecula, CA 92593
Telephone (951) 770-6300 • Fax (951) 506-9491

RECEIVED

January 25, 2018

JAN 31 2018

CITY OF SAN MARCOS
PLANNING DIVISION

VIA E-MAIL and USPS

Susan Vandrew Rodriguez, Associate Planner
City of San Marcos Native American Liaison
1 Civic Center Drive
San Marcos, CA 92069

Chairperson:
Neal Ibanez

Vice Chairperson:
Bridgett Barcello

Committee Members:
Andrew Masiel, Sr.
Darlene Miranda
Evie Gerber
Richard B. Scearce, III
Robert Villalobos

Director:
Gary DuBois

Coordinator:
Paul Macarro

Planning Specialist:
Tuba Ebru Ozdil

Re: Pechanga Tribe Comments on the Cultural Resources Survey and Evaluation Report for the Discovery Village South Project [P16-0037, SP16-002/TSM16-003/DA16-001; Assessor Parcel Numbers: 221-070-19-00, 221-070-20-00, 221-080-11-00; 221-080-12-00; 221-080-18-00; 221-080-19-00; 221-080-23-00; 221-080-24-00; and 221-142-07-00]

Dear Ms. Vandrew Rodriguez:

This comment letter is written on behalf of the Pechanga Band of Luiseño Indians (hereinafter, “the Tribe”), a federally recognized Indian tribe and sovereign government. The Tribe submits these comments for the official record concerning the Cultural Resources Survey and Evaluation Report for the Discovery Village South Project prepared by DUDEK and dated November 2017.

The Tribe extends its thanks the City for providing the Cultural Resource Assessment so that the Tribe can continue to preserve and protect Luiseño cultural resources. In order to provide consistency throughout our consultation and the document, we have provided our comments to the document below for your review and consideration.

The Pechanga Tribe asserts that the Project area is part of ‘Atáxum (Luiseño), and therefore the Tribe’s, aboriginal territory as evidenced by the existence of an ‘Atáxum place name, *tóota yixélval* (rock art, pictographs, petroglyphs), and an extensive Luiseño artifact record in the vicinity of the Project. The Tribe is concerned that in the third paragraph of section 2.1.4 “Ethnographic Period,” the report claims that the Luiseño are a Shoshonean speaking population that are “generally considered to have migrated into the area from the Mojave Desert” (pg. 23). Though the report does correctly state that the Luiseño are a Takic-speaking population later in the paragraph, the Tribe would like to reiterate that the Luiseño language is in the Takic language subgroup of the Uto-Aztecán Language Family. Though the Shoshonean language subgroup and the Takic language subgroup both come from the Uto-Aztecán Language Family, the Luiseño language is not a Shoshonean language. Furthermore, the Luiseño recognize that the world was created in the area now

known as Temecula¹, and the Luiseño People have been in this area since the beginning of time; they have never migrated into the area from the Mojave Desert. Therefore, the Tribe would like to assert that the "Shoshonean Wedge" theory is no longer supported by current research and should be retracted from the cultural report for this project². The Tribe requests our comments and tribal perspective to be also included in the report.

The Tribe understands that the ground visibility during the intensive-level pedestrian survey of the Project APE "was extremely poor (<10-15%)" (pg. 38). Considering the 23 milling slicks and two shallow mortars physically within the Project APE, the numerous cultural resources and place names within a one mile radius of the project, and the poor ground visibility during the most recent survey, the Tribe concurs with the cultural consultant's recommendations for the cultural resources mitigation measures for this project.

The Tribe would like the City to forward these comments to DUDEK, so they may review and make the necessary updates/changes to their report and to include this letter for the record. The Tribe welcomes the opportunity to meet with the City of San Marcos to further explain and provide documentation concerning our specific cultural affiliation to lands within your jurisdiction, particularly for this project. The Tribe reserves the right to fully participate in the environmental review process, as well as to provide further comment on the Project's impacts to cultural resources and potential mitigation for such impacts.

The Pechanga Tribe looks forward to working together with the City of San Marcos in protecting the invaluable Luiseño cultural resources found in the Project area. Please contact me at 951-770-6314 or at CRS@pechanga-nsns.gov. Thank you.

Sincerely,



Molly Earp-Escobar

Cultural Resource Specialist

Cc Pechanga Office of the General Counsel

¹ Masiel-Zamora, Myra, 2016, *'Éxva Teméeku: Where We Began*. Great Oak Press, Pechanga, California.

² Sutton, Mark, 2010, *A Reevaluation of Early Northern Uto-Aztecan Prehistory in Alta California*. California Archaeology, Vol. 2, Issue 1.