



Report

MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION

MEETING DATE: December 5, 2011

SUBJECT: AT&T Mobility Wireless Telecommunication Facility at Twin Oaks Valley Golf Course
CUP 03-607(11M)

Recommendation

Conditionally approve the modification of a wireless telecommunication facility at the Twin Oaks Valley Golf Course.

Introduction

The Twin Oaks Valley Ranch Specific Plan was approved to construct and operate a maximum of five (5) wireless telecommunication facilities within the Twin Oaks Valley golf course between the ninth hole and the driving range. Including this existing project, there are a total of four (4) wireless telecommunication facilities constructed at this location in the golf course. The subject wireless telecommunication facility is a disguised 33'-0" tall broadleaf monotree with six 4'-4" antenna panels mounted in three (3) sectors and an equipment enclosure designed to be a part of the adjacent maintenance structure with stucco walls and a hipped roof with matching concrete tiles.

The current zoning of the property is Twin Oaks Valley Ranch Specific Plan (or SPA). A wireless telecommunication facility in this zone is permitted provided a Conditional Use Permit is approved. The other three (3) existing wireless telecommunication facilities at the Golf Course have similarly been approved by the Commission under separate Conditional Use Permits.

Discussion

As part of a national upgrade of the AT&T network to operate on the 751 MHz Long Term Evolution (LTE) band, the applicant has requested to replace the existing six 4'-4" antenna panels with twelve new 6'-4" antenna panels mounted on the existing three sectors of the faux broadleaf monotree. Although the new antenna panels will be longer, the project has been conditioned to modify the existing faux tree with antenna stocks, additional branches, leaves and natural textures to fully conceal the new facilities within the canopy of the faux monotree. There is sufficient capacity in the existing equipment cabinets to accommodate the additional support components required by the project and no changes are proposed to the exterior of the existing equipment enclosure.

An inspection of the existing facilities was conducted by staff on November 3, 2011. As a result of that inspection, staff determined that although the existing facilities were well maintained there was insufficient branch and leaf coverage to portray a realistic emulation of a broadleaf tree. After consulting with the applicant, the project will be required not only

to add branches near the new antennas, but throughout the canopy to ensure the shape of the faux broadleaf monotree is dense and realistic. Photos from that site inspection are included with this report and contained in Attachment "D."

Section 704 of the Telecommunication Act of 1996 states that "No State or local government or instrumentality thereof may regulate the placement, construction, or modification of personal wireless service facilities on the basis of the environmental effects of radio frequency (RF) emissions to the extent that such facilities comply with the commission's regulations concerning such emissions." The City therefore cannot deny the proposed project based upon perceived health impacts of these facilities. The Federal Communications Commission (FCC) has developed exposure guidelines which are the implementing regulations for Section 704. The FCC guidelines require evaluation to determine whether transmitters of facilities comply with the FCC radio frequency (RF) guidelines and incorporate Maximum Permissible Exposure (MPE) limits. MPE limits are defined in terms of power density, electric field strength, and magnetic field strength to which a person may be exposed without harmful effect. The standards established in the FCC RF guidelines constitute exposure limits and are relevant only to facilities that are accessible to workers or members of the public. Pursuant to the FCC regulations, the City required documentation (an Electromagnetic Energy "EME" Report) from the applicant to confirm the wireless antenna facility is operating within the FCC RF guidelines for MPE. The RF analysis was reviewed by the City's telecommunications consultant who determined that the proposed operation of the facilities would be in compliance with FCC regulations. The EME Report (Attachment "E") and RF Safety Evaluation (Attachment "F") from the City's telecommunications consultant are included with this report.

With the approval of the first CUP, a Negative Declaration (ND 05-725) was prepared, circulated and adopted on August 1, 2005. Because the requested modification proposes no significant expansion or modification of the project site as originally examined in ND 05-725, staff has determined that the proposed project remains within the scope of the previously adopted Negative Declaration and no further action is required. In addition, no public comment has been received by City Staff since the receipt of this request.

Attachment(s)

Adopting Resolution

- A- Vicinity Map
- B- Aerial Photo
- C- Requested Entitlement
- D- Site Photos

- E- Electromagnetic Energy Report
- F- RF Safety Evaluation
- G- Site & Project Characteristics
- H- Site and Project Plans

Submitted by:

Reviewed by:


Jerry Backoff
Planning Division Director


Charlie Schaffer
Development Services Director

ATTACHMENT A Vicinity Map



 Project Site

ATTACHMENT B Aerial Photo



 Project Site



ATTACHMENT C

Requested Entitlements

Major Conditional Use Permit Modification to allow for the removal of six 4'-4" panel antennas and the installation of twelve new 6'-4" panel antennas at an existing wireless telecommunication facility disguised as a broad leaf tree in the Twin Oaks Valley Golf Course in the Twin Oaks Valley Ranch Specific Plan Area (SPA) zone in the Twin Oaks Valley Community Plan.

ATTACHMENT D

Site Photos



View of the disguised wireless telecommunication facility and equipment enclosure seen in the lower right behind row of trees.



View of the existing golf course maintenance building and attached equipment enclosure. The internal boundary is estimated with the dashed red line.

ATTACHMENT G

Site & Project Characteristics

<u>Property</u>	<u>Existing Land use</u>	<u>Zoning</u>	<u>General Plan Designation</u>
Subject	Golf Course	SPA	SPA 1-2 du/ac
North	Single-Family Residence	SPA	SPA 1-2 du/ac
South	Single-Family Residence	SPA	SPA 1-2 du/ac
East	Single-Family Residence	SPA	SPA 1-2 du/ac
West	Single-Family Residence	E-1-20	Est. Res. 1-2 du/ac

Flood Hazard Zone	<u> </u> yes	<u> x </u> no
Resource Conserv. Area	<u> </u> yes	<u> x </u> no
Redevelop. Proj. Area	<u> </u> yes	<u> x </u> no
Sewers	<u> x </u> yes	<u> </u> no
Septic	<u> </u> yes	<u> x </u> no
Water	<u> x </u> yes	<u> </u> no
Gen. Plan Conformance	<u> x* </u> yes	<u> </u> no
Land Use Compatibility	<u> x* </u> yes	<u> </u> no

* with approval of CUP.

Development Standards of the Twin Oaks Valley Ranch SPA Zone:

<u>Setbacks</u>	<u>Required</u>	<u>Existing WTF structure</u>
Front	18 ft.	≈ 700 ft.
Rear	5 ft.	≈ 675 ft.
Side	10 ft.	≈ 550 ft.
Height	35 ft.	32'-7" ft.

ATTACHMENT H
Site & Project Plans